

ALT Meeting Agenda and Minutes

Meeting Name	Assessment for Learning Team (ALT)
Date	9/21/2022 Time: 3:00-4:00 pm
Location	M197

Meeting Purpose

The Assessment for Learning Team (ALT) recommends, facilitates, and supports policies, processes and practices used by the college for assessing learning. ALT is led by faculty and student affairs and consists of representatives from each Academic Division, Student Affairs, Student Services, the Office of Institutional Effectiveness, and Administration. In support of PVCC Strategic Goals located in [Strategic Plan 2018-2022](#) ALT strives to make assessment a sustainable collaborative process that clarifies learning expectations, promotes meaningful dialogue and transparency, uses evidence to improve learning, and facilitates organizational change. (Strategic goal 1.1)The General Education Learning Outcomes help students develop the skills necessary for 21st century workforce demands and assessed across the college in academic, occupational, and co-curricular contexts.(Strategic goal 2.3)

Attendance

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Felicia Ramirez ALT Chair & COM/HUM Representative	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Leonard Macias ALT Chair & ENG Representative	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Doug Berry VPAA	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Jamie Martin Dean Academic Affairs
<input type="checkbox"/>	Jim Rubin Counseling Representative	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Meggin Kirk Social Sciences Representative	<input type="checkbox"/>	Brian Goegan Business Representative	<input type="checkbox"/>	Mary Early Learning Success Center Representative
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Darra Browning Science Representative	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Tomi Johnston Fine Arts Representative	<input type="checkbox"/>	Dale Heuser Health Representative	<input type="checkbox"/>	Teresa Dominguez Math Center
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Jennifer Brown Behavioral Sciences Representative	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Sami Lange Library Representative	<input type="checkbox"/>	Mike Ho Student Affairs Representative	<input type="checkbox"/>	Open IE Representative
<input type="checkbox"/>	Jessica Bruhn Nursing Representative	<input type="checkbox"/>	Kara Childs Math Representative	<input type="checkbox"/>	Kathaerine Johnson Student Affairs Representative	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Jennifer Miller Dean Student Affairs
	Guests:						

Meeting Agenda

- 1. Minutes from prior meeting were sent via email**
- 2. Welcome New Members & Introductions**

ALT would like to welcome new members: Jennifer Brown, Brian Goegan, & Dale Heuser

- 3. Assessment updates**

- Assessment Labs_Monday, 9/28, in the Computer Commons, 2-3 pm in E-142 and Monday 12/12, 12:00pm-2:00pm in E-136

- Bachelor's HLC Site Visit:**

The site visit went well. The HLC peer reviewers were satisfied with the answers PV provided to them. PV took about 4-5 questions during the session. Some questions HLC asked were: *How does PV train new faculty regarding assessment, How does PV differentiate between AA outcomes and BA outcomes, and is there one assessment plan that all the colleges follow.* HLC should be done with their review by December.

- President Assessment Awards (Newsletter)**

Recognized last year's winners (ALT had two reps who won awards, Darra and Sami, YEA!!). Volunteers who helped read all of last year's projects and select and grade winners mentioned it was an enjoyable but learning experience. They learned a lot about what assessment projects faculty are doing on campus. One volunteer remarked how they saw the commitment and passion to teaching and

learning come across through the projects.

d. Meeting Time (2:00-3:00, 2:30-3:30,3:00-4:00)

Felicia & Leonard will send out a survey to committee members asking input for selecting another time for our meetings. Will be asking for volunteers to grade assessment projects next year.

ALT Reps were given a form to complete with their Division Chair and department. The form is designed to help departments identify goals/priorities for the 2022/23 year and an action plan for each. The goal is for Academic Departments to engage their faculty in assessment work throughout the year.

4. ALT Goals 2022-2023

1. Improve learning.

2. Increase participation in assessment.

1. Increase RFP faculty participation in General Education Assessment to 70%.

Reps, get the word back to your departments, regularly remind faculty of assessment lab dates and the need to document learning.

2. Increase number/rates of completion of assessment forms in GEA online tool.

Reps, please make sure that faculty know that in addition to inputting their scores they also need to fill out the three-part forms in GEA completely, all three forms and to answer all questions in detail.

3. Increase PAR first year faculty participation/documentation in the GEA online tool to 100%.

Let any PAR in your department know about assessment lab dates and to assist them if they have questions or need help documenting results in the GEA Online Tool,

4. Increase adjunct faculty participation in General Education Assessment and completion of assessment forms in GEA online tool.

The same here, coordinate with your Division Chair and Faculty Leads so they can disseminate information about assessment training, accessing and using the GEA Online Tool, and assisting adjunct faculty with their projects.

5. Identify a sustainable model for recognizing and rewarding excellence in assessment.

Next year's awards will be different in regards to cash. PV can not award cash awards to employees. ALT will need to identify alternate gifts. Some ideas for gifts were: prime parking spots, cool stickers, trip to conference of choice and dinner with an administrator.

3. Develop a plan for assessing learning in Dual Enrollment courses.

One plan that was discussed was using PV library faculty to partner with dual enrollment

faculty and perform an assessment project that way. Another was to create an Assessment Award just for adjunct faculty. Jaime was going to look into this possibility and obtain a list of all dual enrollment instructors at PV.

The meeting was adjourned at this point because of time. We will resume addressing the remaining items on this agenda.

4. *Continue mapping cocurricular learning experiences and identify and engage 1-3 cocurricular learning areas to complete assessment projects.*
 5. *Develop processes and supporting materials to assist faculty with assessment of Program Learning Outcomes (PLOs).*
 6. *Draft a statement to link newly updated MCCD General Education Philosophy with PVCC assessment and Institutional Learning Outcomes (ILOs).*
 7. *Complete AAC&U ePortfolio institute (Jan. 2023).*
 8. *Engage ALT in the scholarship of assessment for learning and completion of ALT goals.*
 9. *Make substantial progress on Criterion #4 recommendations by HLC, track assessment results, and gather evidence for HLC in preparation for 2024 visit.*
 10. *Support PVCC efforts to offer Bachelor Degrees.*
 - a. *Collaborate with EDU faculty to obtain approval for Education Bachelor degree.*
 - b. *Collaborate with NUR faculty Begin work for Nursing BSN.*
 11. *Develop professionalism (Civic Engagement/Personal Development) and ePortfolio dimensions (Technology).*
 12. *Improving messaging to students about the value of general education including: explicit messages in PVCC website about what students can learn and why it's important, improve the student inventory.*
 13. *Continue connection with Critical Thinking Academy and further institutionalize the critical thinking framework.*
 14. *Continue efforts with Excelencia as part of commitment to culturally responsive assessment.*
5. Program Learning Outcome Form (link to form)
<https://docs.google.com/document/d/1fWwDZ3OkLZVLU1QarrpXdW-clYcXgJrw07c0hwB8AYq/edit>
 6. GenEd Statement (next meeting)
 7. **Next Meeting Times: Oct. 19, Nov. 16,**

Action Items			
Task	Team Members	Comments	Due Date
E-portfolio	Leonard, Felicia, Mike, Lynn, John, Jamie	Team will participate in the year long institute.	Ongoing
CoCurricular Mapping		Honors	May 30, 2022
Division	All reps	Collaborate with the Division Chair, set a goal for increasing participation	Oct. 19

Participation		in assessment for learning. Engage those in your division/department in assessment and assist with project design. Complete goal form.	
Seal of Excelencia	Leonard	Leonard will liaison with the Excelencia Team on behalf of ALT https://www.edexcelencia.org/seal-excelencia	Ongoing
Please Read	All reps	HLC by the Numbers: https://download.hlcommission.org/initiatives/RoleofEquityinQualityAssurance_2022-09_PAP.pdf https://drive.google.com/file/d/1EqkoMlNmIZCqbZaAjbfvyXb2kZjLd10/view	

Meeting Minutes:

8. Welcome New Members & Introductions

ALT would like to welcome new members: Jennifer Brown, Brian Goegan, & Dale Heuser

9. Assessment updates

- a. Assessment Labs Monday, 9/28, in the Computer Commons, 2-3 pm in E-142 and Monday 12/12, 12:00pm-2:00pm in E-136

b. Bachelor's HLC Site Visit:

The site visit went well. The HLC peer reviewers were satisfied with the answers PV provided to them. PV took about 4-5 questions during the session. Some questions HLC asked were: *How does PV train new faculty regarding assessment, How does PV differentiate between AA outcomes and BA outcomes, and is there one assessment plan that all the colleges follow.* HLC should be done with their review by December.

c. President Assessment Awards (Newsletter)

Recognized last year's winners (ALT had two reps who won awards, Darra and Sami, YEA!!). Volunteers who helped read all of last year's projects and select and grade winners mentioned it was an enjoyable but learning experience. They learned a lot about what assessment projects faculty are doing on campus. One volunteer remarked how they saw the commitment and passion to teaching and learning come across through the projects.

d. Meeting Time (2:00-3:00, 2:30-3:30, 3:00-4:00)

Felicia & Leonard will send out a survey to committee members asking input for selecting another time for our meetings. Will be asking for volunteers to grade assessment projects next year.

ALT Reps were given a form to complete with their Division Chair and department. The form is designed to help departments identify goals/priorities for the 2022/23 year and an action plan for each. The goal is for Academic Departments to engage their faculty in assessment work throughout the year.

10. ALT Goals 2022-2023

2. Improve learning.

3. Increase participation in assessment.

1. Increase RFP faculty participation in General Education Assessment to 70%.

Reps, get the word back to your departments, regularly remind faculty of

assessment lab dates and the need to document learning.

2. Increase number/rates of completion of assessment forms in GEA online tool.

Reps, please make sure that faculty know that in addition to inputting their scores they also need to fill out the three-part forms in GEA completely, all three forms and to answer all questions in detail.

3. Increase PAR first year faculty participation/documentation in the GEA online tool to 100%.

Let any PAR in your department know about assessment lab dates and to assist them if they have questions or need help documenting results in the GEA Online Tool,

4. Increase adjunct faculty participation in General Education Assessment and completion of assessment forms in GEA online tool.

The same here, coordinate with your Division Chair and Faculty Leads so they can disseminate information about assessment training, accessing and using the GEA Online Tool, and assisting adjunct faculty with their projects.

5. Identify a sustainable model for recognizing and rewarding excellence in assessment.

Next year's awards will be different in regards to cash. PV can not award cash awards to employees. ALT will need to identify alternate gifts. Some ideas for gifts were: prime parking spots, cool stickers, trip to conference of choice and dinner with an administrator.

9. Develop a plan for assessing learning in Dual Enrollment courses.

One plan that was discussed was using PV library faculty to partner with dual enrollment faculty and perform an assessment project that way. Another was to create an Assessment Award just for adjunct faculty. Jaime was going to look into this possibility and obtain a list of all dual enrollment instructors at PV.

The meeting was adjourned at this point because of time. We will resume addressing the remaining items on this agenda.

Meeting adjourned at 4:07pm

ALT Meeting Agenda and Minutes

Meeting Name	Assessment for Learning Team (ALT)
Date	10/19/2022 Time: 2:00-3:00 pm
Location	M197

Meeting Purpose

The Assessment for Learning Team (ALT) recommends, facilitates, and supports policies, processes and practices used by the college for assessing learning. ALT is led by faculty and student affairs and consists of representatives from each Academic Division, Student Affairs, Student Services, the Office of Institutional Effectiveness, and Administration. In support of PVCC Strategic Goals located in [Strategic Plan 2018-2022](#) ALT strives to make assessment a sustainable collaborative process that clarifies learning expectations, promotes meaningful dialogue and transparency, uses evidence to improve learning, and facilitates organizational change. (Strategic goal 1.1)The General Education Learning Outcomes help students develop the skills necessary for 21st century workforce demands and assessed across the college in academic, occupational, and co-curricular contexts.(Strategic goal 2.3)

Attendance

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Felicia Ramirez ALT Chair & COM/HUM Representative	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Leonard Macias ALT Chair & ENG Representative	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Doug Berry VPAA	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Jamie Martin Dean Academic Affairs
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Jim Rubin Counseling Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> Meggin Kirk Social Sciences Representative	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Brian Goegan Business Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> Mary Early Learning Success Center Representative
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Darra Browning Science Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> Tomi Johnston Fine Arts Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> Dale Heuser Health Representative	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Teresa Dominguez Math Center
<input type="checkbox"/> Jennifer Brown Behavioral Sciences Representative	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Sami Lange Library Representative	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Mike Ho Student Affairs Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> Open IE Representative
<input type="checkbox"/> Jessica Bruhn Nursing Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> Kara Childs Math Representative	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Kathaerine Johnson Student Affairs Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> Jennifer Miller Dean Student Affairs
Guests:			

Meeting Agenda

1. **Minutes from prior meeting were sent via email**
2. **Welcome New Members & Introductions**
ALT would like to welcome new members:, Brian Goegan
3. **Assessment updates**
 - a. Meeting time is 2-3 pm
 - b. Assessment Lab Monday, 12/12, 12:00pm-2:00pm in E-136
 - c. AGECE
 - d. HLC
4. **Assessment Division/Department Goals:** ALT Reps were given a form to complete with their Division Chair and department. The form is designed to help departments identify goals/priorities for the 2022/23 year and an action plan for each. The goal is for Academic Departments to engage their faculty in assessment work throughout the year.
5. **Program Learning Outcome Form (link to form)**
<https://docs.google.com/document/d/1fWwDZ3OkLZVLU1QarrpXdW-clYcXgJrw07c0hwB8AYq/edit>
6. **Cocurricular Learning Mapping**
<https://docs.google.com/spreadsheets/d/1zLQfAONROW4NdcqKS4HtRZvErKs-HBhfGabNv7X-DoY/edit#gid=0>
 - a. Honors (Jenny, John,, Felicia)
 - b. Student Life?
 - c. Career Services ?

7. GenEd Statement (draft)

MCCCD General Education Curriculum, Philosophy, and Values

The MCCCD has identified a [philosophy and values](#) for General Education, which "...is used by MCCCD Center for Curriculum, Transfer and Articulation (CCTA) to ensure relevance and currency of the curriculum at each degree and certificate level, as well as to evaluate the effectiveness of our systems and processes to support the inclusion of General Education in our educational offerings." The MCCCD Curriculum Committee selected the [AAC&U Essential Learning Outcome](#) as the "Values" for general education, which include: Knowledge of Human Cultures and the Physical and Natural World, Intellectual and Practical Skills, Personal and Social Responsibilities, Integrative and Applied Learning.

While evaluation of shared Curriculum across MCCCD occurs at a system level under the purview of the Center for Curriculum, Transfer, and Articulation (CCTA) and Instructional Councils (ICs); the process of assessment for learning is developed and coordinated at each of the individual and singularly accredited colleges. At PVCC the Assessment for Learning Team (ALT) recommends, develops, implements, and supports the philosophies, policies, processes, and practices used by the college for assessment and measuring achievement of student learning outcomes.

Measurement of General Education Essential Skills and PVCC Institutional Learning Outcomes

The Essential Skills selected as "Values" by MCCCD and developed by the AAC&U are often measured at colleges and universities across the country using AAC&U Valid Assessment of Learning in Undergraduate Education (VALUE) Rubrics. According to the AAC&U, "VALUE is an authentic approach to assessment designed to articulate and measure the skills, abilities, and dispositions that students need and that parents, policymakers, and employers demand."

Similarly, at PVCC, we have recognized the significance of helping students develop 21st century skills. PVCC has made a significant and judicious investment in the college's General Education Learning Outcomes, which are the same as the college's Institutional Learning Outcomes (ILO's). The outcomes, corresponding rubrics, and supporting materials represent in-depth research, college wide collaboration, professional development, and organizational learning spanning over 17 years. The outcomes reflect the unique culture of PVCC, the college's mission to educate the whole student, and its goals for positive social change. The outcomes are also infused with critical thinking elements stemming from the college's partnership with the [Foundation for Critical Thinking](#) and work through the [Higher Learning Commission's Persistence and Completion Academy](#). There are nine General Education [rubrics](#): Civic Engagement, Critical Reading, Diversity & Global Awareness, Information Literacy, Personal Development and Wellness, Problem Solving, Oral Communication, Technology, Written Communication and within these rubrics are forty-eight dimensions. There are frequent revisions and new dimensions being developed by the [Assessment for Learning Team](#) (ALT). As the college learns and changes to best serve the needs and interests of students, it has added to and modified the learning outcomes. The process takes time, collaboration, and a readiness to take on the challenges of outcome assessment work.

Faculty have led the assessment efforts at PVCC and have been actively involved, since the

beginning stages of developing the outcomes, in making sense of assessment and creating an assessment process that is meaningful and results in improvement. The learning outcomes are written in the language of PVCC and its members have constructed meaning and shared understanding of learning related to the outcomes. Some departments have worked to develop techniques for calibration procedures to ensure that scoring is consistent when using PVCC rubrics for common course assessment. In the AAC&U documents for the [VALUE Rubrics](#), which apply the [Essential Learning Outcomes](#) (ELOs) that the MCCC curriculum subcommittee selected, state “The core expectations articulated in all 15 of the VALUE rubrics can and should be translated into the language of individual campuses, disciplines, and even courses” (Rhodes, 2010). This process is reflected in the assessment work at PVCC. Collaboration to make improvements to general education learning is fruitful at the institutional level because faculty and staff at the institution work together to integrate learning across the student experience in curricular and cocurricular learning within the college.

References:

Rhodes, T. (2010). *Assessing outcomes and improving achievement: Tips and tools for using rubrics*. Washington, DC: Association of American Colleges and Universities.

Below is a list of AAC&U VALUE Rubrics and List of PVCC GEA Rubrics. The rubrics are not meant to be in complete alignment and PVCC does not gather data on the VALUE rubrics. The PVCC rubrics are older than the VALUE rubrics and meet the needs of assessment at PVCC. The VALUE rubrics are tools that can be referenced, so ALT has completed a crosswalk between all dimensions of the VALUE Rubrics and all of the dimensions of PVCC GEA Rubrics. The crosswalk helps identify opportunities for revisions and additional dimensions as well as recognition of PVCC achievements in developing tools to measure general education skills.

AAC&U Value Rubrics	PVCC General Education Learning Areas
Civic Engagement (Local and Global)	Civic Engagement
Creative Thinking	Critical Reading
Critical Thinking	Diversity and Global Awareness
Ethical Reasoning	Information Literacy
Foundations and Skills for Lifelong Learning	Oral Communication
Global Learning	Personal Development and Wellness
Information Literacy	Problem Solving
Inquiry & Analysis	Technology
Integrative and Applied Learning	Written Communication
Intercultural Knowledge and Competence	
Oral Communication	
Problem Solving	
Quantitative Literacy	

Reading	
Teamwork	
Written Communication	

Measuring ILO's across General Education Designated Courses

Faculty across the college select and measure the Institutional Learning Outcomes (ILOs) using PVCC General Education Assessment Rubrics and document these efforts in the GEA Online Tool. GEA Learning Outcomes are measured and reinforced in both courses designated by MCCCDC as part of the Arizona General Education Curriculum (AGEC) and courses without designation. The GEA Online Tool uses information from the Student Information System (SIS) to flag courses with the General Education designation. Additionally, data is used to identify PVCC students' average level of achievement of the learning outcomes using the rubrics as they progress from 0 to completing 11+ general education courses at PVCC.

8. Next Meeting Times: Nov. 16,

Action Items			
Task	Team Members	Comments	Due Date
E-portfolio	Leonard, Felicia, Mike, Lynn, John, Jamie	Team will participate in the year long institute.	Ongoing
CoCurricular	Felicia, Jenny W., Mike, Sami, Kat	Honors, Student Life, Library,	May 30, 2022
Division Participation	All reps	Collaborate with the Division Chair, set a goal for increasing participation in assessment for learning. Engage those in your division/department in assessment and assist with project design. Complete goal form.	Oct. 19
Seal of Excelencia	Leonard	Leonard will liaison with the Excelencia Team on behalf of ALT https://www.edexcelencia.org/seal-excelencia	Ongoing
Please Read	All reps	HLC by the Numbers: https://download.hlcommission.org/initiatives/RoleofEquityinQualityAssurance_2022-09_PAP.pdf https://drive.google.com/file/d/1EgkoMlNmI2CqbZaAjbtvyXb2kzLd10/view	

Meeting Minutes:

- Mike won a [NASPA](#) Award....he won it for his region, there are six mid-level professional awards...Mike is the first person from a community college to have won the award.
- New time for our meetings will be 2-3pm.....Don't forget the next assessment lab on 12-2 in E-136
- New AGEC. Here is the link for the AZ transfers Reimagining the AGEC:
https://aztransfer.com/about/reimagining_the_agec.html ...
The goal is to create one AGEC for all Community Colleges in Arizona....The committee has been split into sub-groups by designation, the new AGEC will be about 32-35 credits....special designations appear to be going away...C, H, L, G. ABOR's mandate initiated the revision of general education at the three state universities and now the community colleges are working on revising general studies.

ALT would like Betina Celis to send out an email/communication explaining the process. Felicia spoke to Annapurna Ganesh (Maricopa General Studies Faculty Representative -Faculty Early Childhood Education & Department Chair Education Studies, annapurna.ganesh@mesacc.edu) at the CCTA professional development session on general studies this week and she recommended that faculty continue to submit proposals for designations while the work to revise the AGECE continues. Felicia is serving on the SB group and will provide updates on the work. It is likely that the drafts of the criteria for the designations will be sent to discipline ATFs for feedback. Resources:

<https://curriculum.maricopa.edu/general-studies>

<https://aztransmac2.asu.edu/cgi-bin/WebObjects/agec.woa/1/wa/agecMatrixReport?inst=001075>



FOUNDATIONS			
First-year Composition (6 cr.) [College-level Technical Writing and Integrated Reading & Writing can be counted as well as ENG 101 and 102]	First-year Composition (3-6 cr.)	English Foundations (4 cr.)	Writer (6 cr.)
Quantitative Reasoning (3 cr.)	Mathematical Studies & Quantitative Applications (6 cr.) [Math (3 cr.) + Quantitative Applications (3 cr.)]	Mathematics Foundations (3 cr.)	Quantitative Thinker (3 cr.)
PERSPECTIVES & CONNECTIONS			
American Institutions (3 cr.)	American Institutions (3 cr.)	American Institutions (3 cr.)	[embedded]
Arts & Humanities (6 cr.)	Literature, Fine Arts, & Humanities (6 cr.)	Arts & Humanities (9 cr.)	Artist (3 cr.) Humanist (3 cr.)
Natural Sciences (6-8 cr.)	Scientific & Engineering Thinking & Practice (8 cr.)	Physical/Life/Space or Earth Sciences (3 cr.)	Natural Scientist (3 cr.)
Social & Behavioral Sciences (6 cr.)	Global Communities, Societies, & Individuals (3 cr.)	Scientific Methods (3-4 cr.)	Social Scientist (3 cr.)
Skills for a Productive Life (3 cr.) [Courses in this category include 21 st Century Skills: learning & innovation, oral & visual communication, digital literacy, financial literacy, and career skills; may also include internships and college success skills courses]	Governance & Civic Engagement (3 cr.)	Social Sciences (3 cr.)	Building Connections (9 cr.) [courses will connect the "exploring" disciplines]
	Global Sustainability (3 cr.)	Social & Political Worlds (6 cr.)	
SPECIAL REQUIREMENTS			
Special Designations [embedded]: -Intensive Writing/Critical Inquiry -Ethnic/Gender/Class Awareness -Global/International/-Historical Awareness		Diversity Perspectives [embedded]: - Global Diversity (3 cr.) - Indigenous Peoples (3 cr.) - Intersectional Identities (3 cr.) - U.S. Ethnic Diversity (3 cr.)	Intro to GenEd (1 cr.)
			GenEd Exit Course (1 cr.)
			Second language proficiency is required for graduation, but is not a general education requirement.
TOTAL: 33-35	TOTAL: 32 (+ 3-6 credits of composition)	TOTAL: 34-35	TOTAL: 32

Notes: Universities with special designations on courses will grant the designation to incoming transfer students who have taken the course regardless of whether the originating institution's course carried that designation.

- HLC Criterion 4b has had one meeting; everyone is still reading and getting familiar with the document and identifying evidence. Doug is getting another meeting together next week to give information on the actual site visit.

- Criterion 4b will start to see more info coming out about HLC...
- .Fire Science is having its site visit in March...Peer Reviewer will meet with people at Black Mountain campus before March.
- Education dept. Is turning in documents for their BA program.
- Nursing-BSN application in February.
- Katherine says to keep in mind for funding....takes time, up to 12 months...can't make DOE move faster. Financial aid & VA piece are separate and should be noted...very important

4. Assessment Division/Department Goals

- Jim is doing a pretest for (google survey) his one and two credit courses....FYE classes and course outcomes....partnering with several other schools?
- Darra....main focus in her department is to get 70% participation with assessment and will post pathway/program assessments related to their dept.
- Student life- Mike was asked if he can create a survey that is applicable to all clubs or at least their club officers?
Katherine- student workers....work study program is effective. The goal is to retain workers; however,are students in the program getting skills to be competitive?
Form at the beginning of semester....then assess what 3 items they identify...and then identify another 3 and are assessed by their supervisor.
- VA- reinstate orientation program for veterans because they are not getting enough information or from not enough areas?
- Sami Lange- Library will submit two GEA for the year. Library is using civic engagement rubric.....some stuff crosses over to written communication rubric.
- Financial Aid-expected to get 70%; staff not expected for 70%-a different goal is more appropriate for student affairs
- Invite SALT & Library to next meeting about modifying GEA (forums)
- COM/HUM/LANG has created goals to increase RFP participation. COM 225 is doing a common course assessment to include adjuncts and measure both GEA/COM PLOs simultaneously.

TASK ITEMS:

1. Review item 7 of the agenda, MCCC/PVCC GenEd draft and give feedback before Nov.16, meeting
<https://docs.google.com/document/d/1E7VPSsQXv6SnctCcSYJL3uMecEYdV8clfrvJq7uU2Tk/edit>

ALT Meeting Agenda and Minutes

Meeting Name	Assessment for Learning Team (ALT)
Date	11/16/2022 Time: 2:00-3:00 pm
Location	M197

Meeting Purpose

The Assessment for Learning Team (ALT) recommends, facilitates, and supports policies, processes and practices used by the college for assessing learning. ALT is led by faculty and student affairs and consists of representatives from each Academic Division, Student Affairs, Student Services, the Office of Institutional Effectiveness, and Administration. In support of PVCC Strategic Goals located in [Strategic Plan 2018-2022](#) ALT strives to make assessment a sustainable collaborative process that clarifies learning expectations, promotes meaningful dialogue and transparency, uses evidence to improve learning, and facilitates organizational change. (Strategic goal 1.1)The General Education Learning Outcomes help students develop the skills necessary for 21st century workforce demands and assessed across the college in academic, occupational, and co-curricular contexts.(Strategic goal 2.3)

Attendance

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Felicia Ramirez ALT Chair & COM/HUM Representative	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Leonard Macias ALT Chair & ENG Representative	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Doug Berry VPAA	<input type="checkbox"/>	Jamie Martin Dean Academic Affairs
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Jim Rubin Counseling Representative	<input type="checkbox"/>	Meggin Kirk Social Sciences Representative	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Brian Goegan Business Representative	<input type="checkbox"/>	Mary Early Learning Success Center Representative
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Darra Browning Science Representative	<input type="checkbox"/>	Tomi Johnston Fine Arts Representative	<input type="checkbox"/>	Dale Heuser Health Representative	<input type="checkbox"/>	Teresa Dominguez Math Center
<input type="checkbox"/>	Jennifer Brown Behavioral Sciences Representative	<input type="checkbox"/>	Sami Lange Library Representative	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Mike Ho Student Affairs Representative	<input type="checkbox"/>	Open IE Representative
<input type="checkbox"/>	Jessica Bruhn Nursing Representative	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Kara Childs Math Representative	<input type="checkbox"/>	Katharine Johnson Student Affairs Representative	<input type="checkbox"/>	Jennifer Miller Dean Student Affairs
	Guests:						

Meeting Agenda

1. Minutes from prior meeting were sent via email
2. Assessment updates
 - a. Assessment Lab Monday, 12/12, 12:00pm-2:00pm in E-136
 - b. Any Division Goals updates?
 - c. Maricopa Assessment Committee (MAC) elects officers
 - i. Chair: Julie Morrison (GCC, Psych Faculty)
 - ii. Advisory Team (Kimberly Thompson, MCC- Assessment Director, Ty Welborn, PC-HIS, PHI and Felicia Ramirez, PVCC-COM)
 - d. AGECE New PPT: https://docs.google.com/presentation/d/1QQoSnLidNK90eHNiYxOl9m0EaPD2FpA8_Y98eUYO8/edit#slide=id.g182b6714081_0_1624
3. Puma Portfolio: https://sites.google.com/d/1Dotppii8xbfsHTs7mYY6URsfnL9-3fBG/p/1qlB5of0aROhosW-U_4inlkKdMkDdrg7H/edit
4. GenEd Statement (draft) <https://docs.google.com/document/d/1E7VPSsQXv6SnctCcSYJL3uMecEYdV8clfrvJq7uU2Tk/edit>
5. Program Learning Outcome Form (link to form) <https://docs.google.com/document/d/1fWwDZ3OkLZVLU1QarrpXdW-clYcXqJrw07c0hwB8AYa/edit>
6. Spring
 - a. Next Meeting Times: Learning Week Jan. 2023, 2/15, 3/22, 4/19
 - b. Call for agenda items

MCCCD General Education Curriculum, Philosophy, and Values

The MCCCD has identified a [philosophy and values](#) for General Education, which "...is used by MCCCD Center for Curriculum, Transfer and Articulation (CCTA) to ensure relevance and currency of the curriculum at each degree and certificate level, as well as to evaluate the effectiveness of our systems and processes to support the inclusion of General Education in our educational offerings." The MCCCD Curriculum Committee selected the [AAC&U Essential Learning Outcome](#) as the "Values" for general education, which include: Knowledge of Human Cultures and the Physical and Natural World, Intellectual and Practical Skills, Personal and Social Responsibilities, Integrative and Applied Learning.

While evaluation of shared Curriculum across MCCCD occurs at a system level under the purview of the Center for Curriculum, Transfer, and Articulation (CCTA) and Instructional Councils (ICs); the process of assessment for learning is developed and coordinated at each of the individual and singularly accredited colleges. At PVCC the Assessment for Learning Team (ALT) recommends, develops, implements, and supports the philosophies, policies, processes, and practices used by the college for assessment and measuring achievement of student learning outcomes.

Measurement of General Education Essential Skills and PVCC Institutional Learning Outcomes

The Essential Skills selected as "Values" by MCCCD and developed by the AAC&U are often measured at colleges and universities across the country using AAC&U Valid Assessment of Learning in Undergraduate Education (VALUE) Rubrics. According to the AAC&U, "VALUE is an authentic approach to assessment designed to articulate and measure the skills, abilities, and dispositions that students need and that parents, policymakers, and employers demand."

Similarly, at PVCC, we have recognized the significance of helping students develop 21st century skills. PVCC has made a significant and judicious investment in the college's General Education Learning Outcomes, which are the same as the college's Institutional Learning Outcomes (ILO's). The outcomes, corresponding rubrics, and supporting materials represent in-depth research, college wide collaboration, professional development, and organizational learning spanning over 17 years. The outcomes reflect the unique culture of PVCC, the college's mission to educate the whole student, and its goals for positive social change. The outcomes are also infused with critical thinking elements stemming from the college's partnership with the [Foundation for Critical Thinking](#) and work through the [Higher Learning Commission's Persistence and Completion Academy](#). There are nine General Education [rubrics](#): Civic Engagement, Critical Reading, Diversity & Global Awareness, Information Literacy, Personal Development and Wellness, Problem Solving, Oral Communication, Technology, Written Communication and within these rubrics are forty-eight dimensions. There are frequent revisions and new dimensions being developed by the [Assessment for Learning Team](#) (ALT). As the college learns and changes to best serve the needs and interests of students, it has added to and modified the learning outcomes. The process takes time, collaboration, and a readiness to take on the challenges of outcome assessment work.

Faculty have led the assessment efforts at PVCC and have been actively involved, since the beginning stages of developing the outcomes, in making sense of assessment and creating an assessment process that is meaningful and results in improvement. The learning outcomes are written in the language of PVCC and its members have constructed meaning and shared understanding of learning related to the outcomes. Some departments have worked to develop techniques for calibration procedures to ensure that scoring is consistent when using PVCC rubrics for common course assessment. In the AAC&U documents for the [VALUE Rubrics](#), which apply the [Essential Learning Outcomes](#) (ELOs) that the MCCCD curriculum subcommittee selected, state "The core expectations articulated in all 15 of the VALUE rubrics can and should be translated into the language of individual campuses, disciplines, and even courses" (Rhodes, 2010). This process is reflected in the assessment work at PVCC. Collaboration to make improvements to general education learning is fruitful at the institutional level because faculty and staff at the institution work together to integrate learning across the student experience in curricular and cocurricular learning within the college.

References:

Rhodes, T. (2010). *Assessing outcomes and improving achievement: Tips and tools for using rubrics*. Washington, DC: Association of American Colleges and Universities.

Below is a list of AAC&U VALUE Rubrics and List of PVCC GEA Rubrics. The rubrics are not meant to be in complete alignment and PVCC does not gather data on the VALUE rubrics. The PVCC rubrics are older than the VALUE rubrics and meet the needs of assessment at PVCC. The VALUE rubrics are tools that can be referenced, so ALT has completed a crosswalk between all dimensions of the VALUE Rubrics and all of the dimensions of PVCC GEA Rubrics. The crosswalk helps identify opportunities for revisions and additional dimensions as well as recognition of PVCC achievements in developing tools to measure general education skills.

AAC&U Value Rubrics	PVCC General Education Learning Areas
Civic Engagement (Local and Global)	Civic Engagement
Creative Thinking	Critical Reading
Critical Thinking	Diversity and Global Awareness
Ethical Reasoning	Information Literacy
Foundations and Skills for Lifelong Learning	Oral Communication
Global Learning	Personal Development and Wellness
Information Literacy	Problem Solving
Inquiry & Analysis	Technology
Integrative and Applied Learning	Written Communication
Intercultural Knowledge and Competence	
Oral Communication	
Problem Solving	
Quantitative Literacy	
Reading	
Teamwork	
Written Communication	

Measuring ILO's across General Education Designated Courses

Faculty across the college select and measure the Institutional Learning Outcomes (ILOs) using PVCC General Education Assessment Rubrics and document these efforts in the GEA Online Tool. GEA Learning Outcomes are measured and reinforced in both courses designated by MCCC as part of the Arizona General Education Curriculum (AGEC) and courses without designation. The GEA Online Tool uses information from the Student Information System (SIS) to flag courses with the General Education designation. Additionally, data is used to identify PVCC students' average level of achievement of the learning outcomes using the rubrics as they progress from 0 to completing 11+ general education courses at PVCC.

Action Items			
Task	Team Members	Comments	Due Date
E-portfolio	Leonard, Felicia, Mike, Lynn, John, Jamie	Team will participate in the year long institute.	Ongoing
CoCurricular	Felicia, Jenny W., Mike, Sami, Kat	Honors, Student Life, Library,	May 30, 2022
Division Participation	All reps	Collaborate with the Division Chair, set a goal for increasing participation in assessment for learning. Engage those in your division/department in assessment and assist with project design. Complete goal form.	Oct. 19
Seal of Excelencia	Leonard	Leonard will liaison with the Excelencia Team on behalf of ALT https://www.edexcelencia.org/seal-excelencia	Ongoing
Please Read	All reps	HLC by the Numbers: https://download.hlcommission.org/initiatives/RoleofEquityinQualityAssurance_2022-09_PAP.pdf https://drive.google.com/file/d/1IEgkoMINmIZCqbZaAjbvvyXb2kzLd10/view	

Meeting Minutes:

Task Items:

7. Minutes from prior meeting were sent via email

8. Assessment updates

- a. Assessment Lab Monday, 12/12, 12:00pm-2:00pm in E-136 - tell your dept. To attend and get help
- b. Any Division Goals updates? - *tell your departments to fill out all 3 forms in detail, make sure there are no gaps, and don't worry about intervention methods that don't work...as long as you document the process.*
- c. *Darra's dept. Will be selecting a rotation of teachers who will assess program outcomes and their approach*
- d. Maricopa Assessment Committee (MAC) elects officers: Committee is now officially recognized as a District Committee
 - i. Chair: Julie Morrison (GCC, Psych Faculty)
 - ii. Advisory Team (Kimberly Thompson, MCC- Assessment Director, Ty Welborn, PC-HIS, PHI and Felicia Ramirez, PVCC-COM)
- e. AGECE New PPT: https://docs.google.com/presentation/d/1QQoSnLidNK90eHNjYXxOJ9m0EaPD2FpA8_Y98eUYO8/edit#slide=id.g182b6714081_0_1624

Decisions are being made at the District level about changing designations on the AGECE, there is no MCCCDC representation other than Bettina Celis from District. ABOR is involved but not sure how...

9. Puma Portfolio: https://sites.google.com/d/1Dotopii8xbfsHTs7mYY6URsfnL9-3fBG/p/1qLB5of0aROhosW-U_4inlkKdMKdDrg7H/edit

FOI faculty leads are not discussing academic prep..Puma Portfolio is being used by students in FYE. Create a word doc and list the instructions in there....Will start piloting this in spring...La Guardia Community College is the college PV is working with on the eportfolio process...La Guradia uses Digication for their portfolios...give any feedback to Felicia Ramirez about eportfolios, what can PV do....

10. GenEd Statement (draft) <https://docs.google.com/document/d/1E7VPSsQXv6SnctCcSYJL3uMecEYdV8clfrvJg7uU2Tk/edit>
We have reviewed District's Gen Ed. Statement and at the meeting everyone was okay with it....will email to rest of committee for approval.

11. Program Learning Outcome Form (link to form)
<https://docs.google.com/document/d/1fWwDZ3OkLZVLU1QarrpXdW-clYcXgJrw07c0hwB8AYg/edit>

12. Spring

- a. Next Meeting Times: Learning Week Jan. 2023, 2/15, 3/22, 4/19
- b. Call for agenda items

ALT Meeting Agenda and Minutes

Meeting Name	Assessment for Learning Team (ALT)
Date	2/15/2023 Time: 2:00-3:00 pm
Location	M197

Meeting Purpose

The Assessment for Learning Team (ALT) recommends, facilitates, and supports policies, processes and practices used by the college for assessing learning. ALT is led by faculty and student affairs and consists of representatives from each Academic Division, Student Affairs, Student Services, the Office of Institutional Effectiveness, and Administration. In support of PVCC Strategic Goals located in [Strategic Plan 2018-2022](#) ALT strives to make assessment a sustainable collaborative process that clarifies learning expectations, promotes meaningful dialogue and transparency, uses evidence to improve learning, and facilitates organizational change. (Strategic goal 1.1)The General Education Learning Outcomes help students develop the skills necessary for 21st century workforce demands and assessed across the college in academic, occupational, and co-curricular contexts.(Strategic goal 2.3)

Attendance

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Felicia Ramirez ALT Chair & COM/LA Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> Leonard Macias ALT Chair & ENG Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> VPAA	<input type="checkbox"/> Doug Berry Dean Academic Affairs
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Jim Rubin Counseling Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> Meggin Kirk Social Sciences Representative	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Brian Goegan Business Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> Mary Early Learning Success Center Representative
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Darra Browning Science Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> Tomi Johnston Fine Arts Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> Dale Heuser Health Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> Teresa Dominguez Math Center
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Kathleen Walker/Julie Lazzara Behavioral Sciences Representative	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Sami Lange Library Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> Mike Ho Student Affairs Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> Open IE Representative
<input type="checkbox"/> Jessica Bruhn Nursing Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> Kara Childs Math Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> Katharine Johnson Student Affairs Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> Jennifer Miller Dean Student Affairs
Guests:			

Meeting Agenda

1. **Minutes from prior meeting were sent via email**
 - a. Updated Charter has been added to the assessment website.
<https://docs.google.com/document/d/1E7VPSsQXv6SnctCcSYJL3uMecEYdV8clfrvJq7uU2Tk/edit>
2. **Assessment updates**
 - a. Assessment Lab Monday, May 8, 12:00-2:00 pm, E 136
 - b. Any Division Goals updates?
 - i. <https://docs.google.com/document/d/1ri-DQQWx0fq4jpxNAGhC4w5eJpcYeSzUP8wZSAgcyX4/edit>
 - c. Maricopa Assessment Committee (MAC) :**Big A- Assessment** with Julie Morrison, Ty Welborn, and Felicia Ramirez
 - [Slide deck](#)
 - [Recording](#)
 - Password: pQSMB3fc
 - [MCCCD Assessment Committee Membership List](#)

- d. AGEC Feedback: Per Annapurna (MCC) You are invited to review the [Redesigning AGEC website](#) for updated information and criteria shared in the **AGEC Criteria Vetting Details document** (latest information) shared on the [AZ Transfer Reimagining AGEC Website](#) Institutional feedback is suggested - you are encouraged to collaborate with colleagues from your respective disciplines/departments/committees/councils, on behalf of Maricopa please use the following **google form to provide your feedback**, [Maricopa Feedback Form](#) There is no restriction on the number of times you can provide feedback. Open comment period until **March 31, 2023**

3. Puma Portfolio: https://sites.google.com/d/1Dotppii8xbfsHTs7mYY6URsfNL9-3fBG/p/1ql_B5of0aROhosW-U_4inlkKdMKdDrg7H/edit

4. Program Learning Outcome Form (link to form)
<https://docs.google.com/document/d/1fWwDZ3OkLZVLU1QarrpXdW-clYcXgJrw07c0hwB8AYq/edit>

5. New Rubric Dimensions -We need teammates to help with drafts

a. Professionalism

Student Professionalism:

Demonstrates the conduct, behavior, and attitude that are characteristic of a successful professional.

Professional Image (appearance)-dress and grooming is appropriate for work- based experience context and in guidance with dress code and/or professional standards.

Professional Demeanor: Focused on work responsibilities, integrity, effective work habits,

Professional Resilience and Emotional Intelligence: Accept and reflect on feedback to assist as you learn and grow; manage emotions, Develop coping skills to manage setbacks and challenges with a positive and constructive attitude.

Accepting responsibility and accountability for words and actions arriving in time to begin required activities promptly and completing tasks in the required timeframe

Your attitude at work may influence your appearance of professionalism, so remaining optimistic when facing challenges is an important skill to develop. Do your best to implement mood-stabilizing techniques, such as meditation or breathing exercises, to remain calm and positive during challenges.

Professionalism

Professionalism has long been a hallmark of an important workplace competency; OCTAE includes it under their conception of personal qualities. ETS includes it in their model as initiative and being a good workplace citizen. Casner-Lotto, Rosenblum, and Wright (2006) defined professionalism/work ethic as the ability to “demonstrate personal accountability, effective work habits, e.g., punctuality, working productively with others, and time and workload management” (p. 16). Given the different yet similar approaches, professionalism proves squirrelly to define.

The NACE task force wrestled with updating this definition while simultaneously considering the critique that professionalism is rooted in whiteness and can be used as an avenue to discriminate against employees of color (Gray, 2019). The critique rests on the idea that standards of professionalism serve as a coded language that favors the culture and values of white and Western employees. For example, braided hair, a natural hairstyle for Black or African-Americans, may not be considered professional, while other whiter, more Western, natural hair styles are considered professional. The task force determined the concept of professionalism is deeply embedded in the workplace; it’s a commonly used term and idea. Therefore, it is more useful to provide helpful guidance around this construct rather than adopt a new term that could later become problematic. Moreover, the task force decided to specify the term, removing some of the ambiguity that enables bias to creep into people’s evaluations of what is professional and what is not. The empirically-supported behaviors provided in Appendix A are the most specific the task force could reach in providing sample behaviors that are inclusive of cultures and values while reflecting the underlying concepts of professionalism to the extent they can be unbiased. To that end, the task force adopted the following definition: Knowing work

environments differ greatly, understand and demonstrate effective work habits, and act in the interest of the larger community and workplace.

Resources:

Indeed

<https://www.indeed.com/career-advice/career-development/professionalism-skills>

Virginia Tech Career and Professional Development

<https://career.vt.edu/develop/professionalism.html>

NACE Career Readiness Competencies

<https://www.naceweb.org/uploadedfiles/files/2021/resources/nace-career-readiness-competencies-revised-apr-2021.pdf>

<https://www.naceweb.org/uploadedfiles/files/2022/resources/2022-nace-career-readiness-development-and-validation.pdf>

Student Professionalism

<https://www.unmc.edu/com/currentstudents/student-professionalism.html>

6. Next Meeting Times: 3/22, 4/19

a. Call for agenda items

Action Items			
Task	Team Members	Comments	Due Date
Professionalism (creation of new rubric dimension)	All members	Talk to faculty/staff in your area and gather ideas/resources for the new dimension to measure Professionalism. Add ideas/information to the google doc. https://docs.google.com/document/d/1nErBhU9V0so4dInNFDh3lCmJEiGtPjzzvX7l_0jYmU/edit	March 22, 2023 (Before next meeting)
E-portfolio	Leonard, Felicia, Mike, Lynn, John, Jamie	Team will participate in the year long institute.	Ongoing
CoCurricular	Felicia, Jenny W., Mike, Sami,	Honors, Student Life, Library,	May 30, 2023
Division Participation	All members	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Ensure that Assessment is a topic on Division/Department agendas. 2. Encourage faculty/staff in your area to participate in assessment of learning, documentation of projects in GEA. Goal is 70% of RFP faculty will complete a General Education Assessment project. 	May 10,, 2023
Seal of Excelencia	Leonard	Leonard will liaison with the Excelencia Team on behalf of ALT https://www.edexcelencia.org/seal-excelencia	Ongoing
Please Read	All reps	HLC by the Numbers: https://download.hlcommission.org/initiatives/RoleofEquityinQualityAssurance_2022-09_PAP.pdf https://drive.google.com/file/d/1lEgkoMINmIzCqbZaAjbtvyXb2kzLd10/view	

Meeting Minutes:

1. Felicia shared that the minutes from prior meeting were sent via email and that the General Education/General Studies statement, which ALT approved in the Fall, has been added to the ALT Charter. The updated Charter was uploaded to the assessment website. <https://docs.google.com/document/d/1E7VPSsQXv6SncTccSYJL3uMecEYdV8clfrvJq7uU2Tk/edit>
2. **Assessment updates**
 - a. Felicia asked reps to let faculty/staff know that there will be an open Assessment Lab Monday, May 8, 12:00-2:00 pm, E 136.
 - b. The team reviewed the results of participation in assessment for Fall 2022. Team members can review the faculty who have submitted forms in GEA for Fall and use the information to engage in conversation about participation at division meetings or with Chairs.
<https://docs.google.com/document/d/1ri-DQQWx0fq4jpxNAGhc4w5eJpcYeSzUP8wZSAgcyX4/edit>
 - c. Felicia provided the link to the recording of the presentation she and other Assessment Leaders on the Maricopa Assessment Committee (MAC) gave to Instructional Councils :**Big A- Assessment** with Julie Morrison (GCC), Ty Welborn (PC), and Felicia Ramírez (PVCC). The presentation included important information about measuring Program Learning Outcomes (PLOs). The information will be added to the Assessment Resources on the PVCC Assessment Website.
 - [Slide deck](#)
 - [Recording](#)
 - Password: pQSMB3fc
 - [MCCCD Assessment Committee Membership List](#)
 - d. AGEC Feedback: Per Annapurna (MCC) You are invited to review the [Redesigning AGEC website](#) for updated information and criteria shared in the **AGEC Criteria Vetting Details document** (latest information) shared on the [AZ Transfer Reimagining AGEC Website](#) Institutional feedback is suggested - you are encouraged to collaborate with colleagues from your respective disciplines/departments/committees/councils, on behalf of Maricopa please use the following **google form to provide your feedback**, [Maricopa Feedback Form](#) There is no restriction on the number of times you can provide feedback. Open comment period until **March 31, 2023**
3. Felicia shared that the Puma Portfolio template is now Live! Faculty and students can access the Puma Portfolio Template through the google sites- template gallery. A guide to help create and customize the ePortfolio is also available for faculty and students. Contact Felicia if you would like more information. Felicia gave a demo of how to access the template and showed the resources in the guide. An official summary of institute experience is forthcoming.

4. Last week the college held an Academic Program Review showcase and several faculty presented.

Friday Feb 10	
Welcome	8:00-8:15am
Honors Program Jenny Hall	8:15-8:30am
International Education	8:30-8:45am
Associate in Arts, Elementary Education, Meggin Kirk	8:45-9:00am
Audio Production, Music Business Brett Reed	9:00-9:15am
	9:15-9:30am
Healthcare Technology Systems Abby Rusu	9:30-9:45am
BREAK	9:45-10:00am
Associates in Arts, Fine Arts Emphasis in Art, Bradley, Pecora, Johnston	10:00-10:15am
Adobe Foundations: Animation and Graphics Production Jon Storslee	10:15-10:30am
Entrepreneurial Studies Level I/Entrepreneurship Education Center	10:30-10:45am
Exercise Science, Heuser	10:45-11:00am
	11:00-11:15am
	11:15-11:30am
Wrap up and thank you	11:30

ALT will need to follow up on the extent to which these program reviews included Program Learning Outcomes Assessment. ALT will likely need to continue refining the Program Learning Outcome Worksheet and make it widely available. Felicia met earlier in the semester with Sandra Hinski to discuss a more involved approach between ALT and Program Review Process.

<https://docs.google.com/document/d/1fWwDZ3OkLZVLU1QarrpXdW-clYcXgJrw07c0hwB8AYg/edit>

5. The team discussed the development of a new GEA learning outcome and rubric dimension related to professionalism. Rationale: When we reviewed GEA learning outcomes and rubrics while applying for the new Bachelors in Elementary/Special Education, ALT identified one opportunity to better serve bachelor level students needs. The team felt that a learning outcome and rubric dimension related to professionalism would help the college support students' development of abilities/mindsets for work-based experiences and future employment.

Felicia shares some of the initial information that she has gathered to help the team develop the new dimension. Two key ideas she found were the concept of "student professionalism" which emphasizes a learning purpose while engaged in work-based experiences. Secondly, information from the NACE noted that "Professionalism has long been a hallmark of an important workplace competency; OCTAE includes it under their conception of personal qualities. ETS includes it in their model as initiative and being a good workplace citizen. Casner-Lotto, Rosenblum, and Wright

(2006) defined professionalism/work ethic as the ability to “demonstrate personal accountability, effective work habits, e.g., punctuality, working productively with others, and time and workload management” (p. 16). Given the different yet similar approaches, professionalism proves squirrely to define. The NACE task force wrestled with updating this definition while simultaneously considering the critique that professionalism is rooted in whiteness and can be used as an avenue to discriminate against employees of color (Gray, 2019). The critique rests on the idea that standards of professionalism serve as a coded language that favors the culture and values of white and Western employees. For example, braided hair, a natural hairstyle for Black or African-Americans, may not be considered professional, while other whiter, more Western, natural hair styles are considered professional. The task force determined the concept of professionalism is deeply embedded in the workplace; it’s a commonly used term and idea. Therefore, it is more useful to provide helpful guidance around this construct rather than adopt a new term that could later become problematic. Moreover, the task force decided to specify the term, removing some of the ambiguity that enables bias to creep into people’s evaluations of what is professional and what is not. The empirically-supported behaviors provided in Appendix A are the most specific the task force could reach in providing sample behaviors that are inclusive of cultures and values while reflecting the underlying concepts of professionalism to the extent they can be unbiased. To that end, the task force adopted the following definition: Knowing work environments differ greatly, understand and demonstrate effective work habits, and act in the interest of the larger community and workplace.

The team is asked to talk to faculty and staff in their areas that are engaged in work-based experiences (Service Learning, Internships, Externships, Job Shadowing, Volunteerism, or other) to determine the elements that are most significant to student development of Professionalism.

Mike mentioned that John McCruddent might have further information based on feedback from potential employers who participate in Job Fair events at PVCC.

6. ALT will also work to develop an ePortfolio Dimension. Leonard is currently gathering information for that dimension and we will discuss this more in March.
7. Meeting adjourned, Next Meeting Times: 3/22, 4/19
 - a. Call for agenda items - Cocurricular Form (Sami)

Task Items:

1. Due by **March 22**, Talk to faculty/staff in your area and gather ideas/resources for the new dimension to measure Professionalism. Add ideas/information to the google doc https://docs.google.com/document/d/1nErBhU9V0so4dlnNFDh3lCmJEIGGtPJzzvX7l_0jYmU/edit
2. Ensure that Assessment is a topic on Division/Department agendas.
3. Encourage faculty/staff in your area to participate in assessment of learning, documentation of projects in GEA. Goal is 70% of RFP faculty will complete a General Education Assessment project.

ALT Meeting Agenda and Minutes

Meeting Name	Assessment for Learning Team (ALT)
Date	2/15/2023 Time: 2:00-3:00 pm
Location	M197

Meeting Purpose

The Assessment for Learning Team (ALT) recommends, facilitates, and supports policies, processes and practices used by the college for assessing learning. ALT is led by faculty and student affairs and consists of representatives from each Academic Division, Student Affairs, Student Services, the Office of Institutional Effectiveness, and Administration. In support of PVCC Strategic Goals located in [Strategic Plan 2018-2022](#) ALT strives to make assessment a sustainable collaborative process that clarifies learning expectations, promotes meaningful dialogue and transparency, uses evidence to improve learning, and facilitates organizational change. (Strategic goal 1.1)The General Education Learning Outcomes help students develop the skills necessary for 21st century workforce demands and assessed across the college in academic, occupational, and co-curricular contexts.(Strategic goal 2.3)

Attendance

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Felicia Ramirez ALT Chair & COM/LA Representative	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Leonard Macias ALT Chair & ENG Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> VPAA	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Doug Berry Dean Academic Affairs
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Jim Rubin Counseling Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> Meggin Kirk Social Sciences Representative	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Brian Goegan Business Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> Mary Early Learning Success Center Representative
<input type="checkbox"/> Darra Browning Science Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> Tomi Johnston Fine Arts Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> Dale Heuser Health Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> Teresa Dominguez Math Center
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Kathleen Walker/Julie Lazzara Behavioral Sciences Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> Sami Lange Library Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> Mike Ho Student Affairs Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> Open IE Representative
<input type="checkbox"/> Jessica Bruhn Nursing Representative	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Kara Childs Math Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> Kathaerine Johnson Student Affairs Representative	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Jennifer Miller Dean Student Affairs
Camila Olave			

Meeting Agenda

1. Minutes from prior meeting were sent via email
2. Assessment updates
 - a. Assessment Lab Monday, May 8, 12:00-2:00 pm, E 136 We need 1 or 2 volunteers to help. Contact Felicia if you can volunteer.
 - b. HLC Site Visit was March 7: HLC visit will be Oct. 14 & 15th 2024
 - c. Maricopa Assessment Committee (MAC)-Dual Enrollment form/Plan
https://docs.google.com/document/d/1lqqzQhv3_Kv9oq3TiKlTFWvGjkYgqrDM5oSho2DtkDs/edit
 Folder: <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/17xVPc3KNmnMkl8PUqpeJc2Q9ZGMrNRje>
 GCC has created a document outlining their DE assessment process. ALT has used GCC's statement to get us started. There is also a folder in the ALT drive so people can share any ideas you may have.
 Maybe each division can have DE instructors do course or program assessments. Div. Chairs can work closely with DE instructors.
 - d. AGECE Feedback: Per Annapurna (MCC) You are invited to review the [Redesigning AGECE website](#) for updated information and criteria shared in the **AGECE Criteria Vetting Details document** (latest information) shared on the [AZ Transfer Reimagining AGECE Website](#) Institutional feedback is suggested - you are encouraged to collaborate with colleagues from your respective disciplines/departments/committees/councils, on behalf of Maricopa please use the following

google form to provide your feedback, [Maricopa Feedback Form](#). There is no restriction on the number of times you can provide feedback. Open comment period until **March 31, 2023**. **Please review the link and provide feedback as needed.**

e. Puma Portfolio site:

<https://www.paradisevalley.edu/employees/assessment-learning/puma-portfolio>

3. New Rubric Dimensions

a. ePortfolio (April)

b. Student Professionalism Add ideas/information to the google doc

https://docs.google.com/document/d/1nErBhU9V0so4dlnNFDh3lCmJEiGGtPJzzvX7l_0jYmU/edit

Draft: BA (3)

Student Professionalism:

Presents a positive image and demeanor that honors the profession and is appropriate for the work based experience, guidelines, or standards. Demonstrates effective work habits including: personal accountability, integrity, time and workload management, working productively with others, communicating clearly/appropriately, and respecting the worth and dignity of every individual. Exhibits a focus on continual improvement, resilience when facing challenges, and effectively adapts to changes. Exhibits a strong capacity for improvement by engaging in behaviors and effectively adapting to ensure continuous improvement in the context/setting of their learning environment(s).

Draft: AA (2)

Student Professionalism

Displays an appropriate appearance and demeanor for the work-based experience, guidelines, or standards. Demonstrates effective work habits including: personal accountability, integrity, time and workload management, working productively with others, communicating clearly and **effectively while** respecting the worth and dignity of every individual. **Demonstrates confidence, reliability, discretion and strong self-discipline when working with others and individually.** Exhibits a strong capacity for improvement by engaging in behaviors that ensure continuous growth in the learning environment including: resilience when facing challenges, ability to adapt, recognition of limitations, and seeking support/resources.

4. Next Meeting Times: 4/19 -ideas for 25th Anniversary Next Year, Cocurricular, ePortfolio dimension

Action Items			
Task	Team Members	Comments	Due Date
Professionalism (creation of new rubric dimension)	All members	Talk to faculty/staff in your area and gather ideas/resources for the new dimension to measure Professionalism. Add ideas/information to the google doc. https://docs.google.com/document/d/1nErBhU9V0so4dlnNFDh3lCmJEiGtPjzzvX7l_0jYmU/edit	March 22, 2023 (Before next meeting)
E-portfolio	Leonard, Felicia, Mike, Lynn, John, Jamie	Team will participate in the year long institute.	Ongoing
CoCurricular	Felicia, Jenny W., Mike, Sami,	Honors, Student Life, Library,	May 30, 2023
Division Participation	All members	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Ensure that Assessment is a topic on Division/Department agendas. 2. Encourage faculty/staff in your area to participate in assessment of learning, documentation of projects in GEA. Goal is 70% of RFP faculty will complete a General Education Assessment project. 	May 10,, 2023
Seal of Excelencia	Leonard	Leonard will liaison with the Excelencia Team on behalf of ALT https://www.edexcelencia.org/seal-excelencia	Ongoing
Please Read	All reps	HLC by the Numbers: https://download.hlcommission.org/initiatives/RoleofEquityinQualityAssurance_2022-09_PAP.pdf https://drive.google.com/file/d/1lEgkoMlNmIZCqbZaAjbrvYXb2kzLd10/view	

Meeting Minutes:

1. Felicia shared that the minutes from prior meeting were sent via email and that the General Education/General Studies statement, which ALT approved in the Fall, has been added to the ALT Charter. The updated Charter was uploaded to the assessment website. <https://docs.google.com/document/d/1E7VPSsQXv6SncfCcSYJL3uMecEYdV8clfrvJq7uU2Tk/edit>
2. **Assessment updates**
 - a. Felicia asked reps to let faculty/staff know that there will be an open Assessment Lab Monday, May 8, 12:00-2:00 pm, E 136.

Task Items:

1. Due by **March 22**, Talk to faculty/staff in your area and gather ideas/resources for the new dimension to measure Professionalism. Add ideas/information to the google doc https://docs.google.com/document/d/1nErBhU9V0so4dlnNFDh3lCmJEiGtPjzzvX7l_0jYmU/edit
2. Ensure that Assessment is a topic on Division/Department agendas.
3. Encourage faculty/staff in your area to participate in assessment of learning, documentation of projects in GEA. Goal is 70% of RFP faculty will complete a General Education Assessment project.

ALT Meeting Agenda and Minutes

Meeting Name	Assessment for Learning Team (ALT)
Date	4/19/2023 Time: 2:00-3:00 pm
Location	M197

Meeting Purpose

The Assessment for Learning Team (ALT) recommends, facilitates, and supports policies, processes and practices used by the college for assessing learning. ALT is led by faculty and student affairs and consists of representatives from each Academic Division, Student Affairs, Student Services, the Office of Institutional Effectiveness, and Administration. In support of PVCC Strategic Goals located in [Strategic Plan 2018-2022](#) ALT strives to make assessment a sustainable collaborative process that clarifies learning expectations, promotes meaningful dialogue and transparency, uses evidence to improve learning, and facilitates organizational change. (Strategic goal 1.1)The General Education Learning Outcomes help students develop the skills necessary for 21st century workforce demands and assessed across the college in academic, occupational, and co-curricular contexts.(Strategic goal 2.3)

Attendance

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Felicia Ramirez ALT Chair & COM/LA Representative	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Leonard Macias ALT Chair & ENG Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> VPAA	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Doug Berry Dean Academic Affairs
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Jim Rubin Counseling Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> Meggin Kirk Social Sciences Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> Brian Goegan Business Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> Mary Early Learning Success Center Representative
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Darra Browning Science Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> Tomi Johnston Fine Arts Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> Dale Heuser Health Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> Teresa Dominguez Math Center
<input type="checkbox"/> Kathleen Walker/Julie Lazzara Behavioral Sciences Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> Sami Lange Library Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> Mike Ho Student Affairs Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> Open IE Representative
<input type="checkbox"/> Jessica Bruhn Nursing Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> Kara Childs Math Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> Kathaerine Johnson Student Affairs Representative	<input type="checkbox"/> Jennifer Miller Dean Student Affairs
Camila Olave	x Dr. Kahlon	x Sami Lange	

Meeting Agenda

1. Minutes from prior meeting were sent via email
2. Assessment updates
 - a. Assessment Lab Monday, May 8, 12:00-2:00 pm, E 136 We need 1 or 2 volunteers to help. Contact Felicia if you can volunteer. Julie Lazzara can from 12-1pm
 - b. Volunteers for scoring PAWS Award...need 2-3 people. Deadline is week after graduation, so scoring begins late May to early June (all virtual). **Jim & Darra Browning can volunteer**
 - c. HLC Site Visit was March 7: HLC visit will be Oct. 14 & 15th 2024 - Talk about the document from HLC
 - d. Maricopa Assessment Committee (MAC)-Dual Enrollment form/Plan
https://docs.google.com/document/d/1lqgzQhv3_Kv9oq3TiKItFWvGikYgqrDM5oSho2DtkDs/edit
 Folder: <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/17xVPc3KNmnMki8PUqpeJc2Q9ZGMrNRje>
 VPAA Meeting - Report out

3. New Rubric Dimensions
 - a. ePortfolio (April)
 - b. Student Professionalism Add ideas/information to the google doc
https://docs.google.com/document/d/1nErBhU9V0so4dlnNFDh3lCmJEiGGtPjzzvX7l_0jYmU/edit
4. 25th Assessment Anniversary: Ideas?

Draft: Student Professionalism

Old: 3 on Rubric

Displays an appropriate appearance and demeanor for the work-based experience, guidelines, or standards. Demonstrates effective work habits including: personal accountability, integrity, time and workload management, working productively with others, communicating clearly and **effectively while** respecting the worth and dignity of every individual. **Demonstrates confidence, reliability, discretion and strong self-discipline when working with others and individually.** Exhibits a strong capacity for improvement by engaging in behaviors that ensure continuous growth in the learning environment including: resilience when facing challenges, ability to adapt, recognition of limitations, and seeking support/resources.

New: 3 on Rubric

Demonstrates a professional attitude and demeanor for the work-based experience. *Accurately* interprets and follows guidelines or standards, and demonstrates effective work habits including: personal accountability, integrity, workload, time management, and communicating *clearly* while respecting others. Demonstrates *significant* resilience when facing challenges, self-motivated, and possesses strong interpersonal skills. Exhibits a strong *understanding* of improvement by engaging in *relevant* and continuous professional growth.

5. Items moving forward. Confirm membership for next year. Ideas for the 25th anniversary. ALT Reps...follow through with your division on wrapping up assessment for 22/23 year. **May 19, 2023** is deadline to submit your assessment project. Scoring would take place between May 22-June 9th. Winners will be announced during August Learning Week.
6. Next Meeting Times: *May meeting?*

Action Items			
Task	Team Members	Comments	Due Date
Professionalism (creation of new rubric dimension)	All members	Talk to faculty/staff in your area and gather ideas/resources for the new dimension to measure Professionalism. Add ideas/information to the google doc. https://docs.google.com/document/d/1nErBhU9V0so4dInNFDh3lCmJEiGtPjzzvX7l_0jYmU/edit	March 22, 2023 (Before next meeting)
E-portfolio	Leonard, Felicia, Mike, Lynn, John, Jamie	Team will participate in the year long institute.	Ongoing
CoCurricular	Felicia, Jenny W., Mike, Sami,	Honors, Student Life, Library,	May 30, 2023
Division Participation	All members	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Ensure that Assessment is a topic on Division/Department agendas. 2. Encourage faculty/staff in your area to participate in assessment of learning, documentation of projects in GEA. Goal is 70% of RFP faculty will complete a General Education Assessment project. 	May 10., 2023
Seal of Excelencia	Leonard	Leonard will liaison with the Excelencia Team on behalf of ALT https://www.edexcelencia.org/seal-excelencia	Ongoing
Please Read	All reps	HLC by the Numbers: https://download.hlcommission.org/initiatives/RoleofEquityinQualityAssurance_2022-09_PAP.pdf https://drive.google.com/file/d/1IEgkoMINmlZCqbZaAjbvYXb2kZjLd10/view	

7. Minutes from prior meeting were sent via email

8. Assessment updates

- Assessment Lab Monday, May 8, 12:00-2:00 pm, E 136 We need 1 or 2 volunteers to help. Contact Felicia if you can volunteer. Julie Lazzara can from 12-1pm
- Volunteers for scoring PAWS Award...need 2-3 people. Deadline is week after graduation, so scoring begins late May to early June (all virtual). **Jim & Darra Browning can volunteer to read them. Do we need a third? Maybe Doug?**
- HLC Site Visit was March 7: HLC visit will be Oct. 14 & 15th 2024 - Talk about the document from HLC. **Dr Douglass from HLC was very impressed, students spoke highly of PV, strong praise for Blk Mtn and Fire Science and all the resources and departments that were represented.**
- Maricopa Assessment Committee (MAC)-Dual Enrollment form/Plan
https://docs.google.com/document/d/1lggzQhv3_Kv9oq3TiKitFWvGjkYgqrDM5oSho2DtKDs/edit
Folder: <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/17xVPc3KNmnMki8PUgpeJc2Q9ZGMrNRje>
VPAA Meeting - Report out-----asking VPAA for their input, other district leaders

9. New Rubric Dimensions

- a. ePortfolio (April) - ***felicia met with about using the eportfolio for student affairs and co curricular activities. New Student Orientation a possibility for promoting the puma portfolio...FOI breakout? Right now, embedding puma portfolio in FYE courses***
- b. Student Professionalism Add ideas/information to the google doc
https://docs.google.com/document/d/1nErBhU9V0so4dlnNFDh3lCmJEiGGtPjzzvX7l_0jYmU/edit

Did speak a little about our meeting with the math dept.

PV not offering BSN anymore, but may offer a BA Accounting...